
YES, THERE ARE...

**ALTERNATIVES TO
THE 2-STATE SOLUTION**

YES, THERE ARE...

Alternatives to the 2-State Solution

**A Mattot Arim information booklet
Copyright © 2017 by Mattot Arim, Israeli NGO
working toward peace-for-peace since 1992**

**To request corrections or report disabled links, contact
mattot.arim@gmail.com**

**Translation from Hebrew:
Batya Jerenberg, Bet-Shemesh, Israel, 054-549-6078**

YES, THERE ARE...



תנועה חוץ-פרלמנטרית של פעילי
ארץ ישראל הגרים בתוך הקו הירוק

“

***“The two-state solution is inapplicable and impossible”
-- Shimon Schiffer, Yediot Acharonot, 10.10.13***

***“It’s no coincidence that the percentage of supporters of the ‘two-state solution’ in the United States has dropped from 58% in 1998 to 39% today.”
-- Washington Post and ABC Survey quoted in Yediot Acharonot, 5.4.2015***

***“The establishment of a Palestinian nation state... seems nearly impossible...due to Jewish settlement...but not for that reason alone. Arab nation states are now completely falling apart.”
-- Sever Plotzker, Yediot Acharonot, 25.10.15***

***“Whoever thinks... a Palestinian state would be different from Syria or Iraq...is ignoring reality....Prime ministers – Rabin, Barak, Sharon – ...understood this.
-- Amnon Abramovich, TV Channel 2 Journalist,
Yediot Acharonot op-ed, 20.12.15***

”

INTRODUCTION

Various think-tanks, international media organizations, and academic fora, such as but not limited to algemeiner.com, Bloomberg.com, Brookings Institution, Christian Science Monitor, Fathom Journal, foreignpolicy.com, Princeton University, swp-berlin.org, and Washington Post, have recently begun to recognize that the so-called two-state “solution” is not necessarily a feasible, best or only path to Middle East stability and well-being.

This document briefly presents a cornucopia of alternatives – authored for the most part by Israeli public figures – to the unworkable 2-state solution. The solutions described herein have been proposed at various times by a variety of prominent women and men on the Israeli political right and center but have not been assembled for serious consideration, to date. Many have thus far been presented only in Hebrew. These alternatives address common concerns such as security, demographics, diplomacy, international law, and economic issues in a manner which differs vastly from the overworked two-state solution.

A concluding section points out not a few common denominators between the alternatives, suggesting that the solutions are combinable. The list of sources also incorporates one-line biographies of the authors.

Policy makers and other concerned thinkers, in Israel and abroad, need to be familiar with this material if they wish to aid in achieving a bright future for Israel and its neighbors.

Exploring the solutions presented in the following pages will of course require expanding the thumbnail alternatives sketched herein to a level of policy detail far beyond the scope of this introductory document. This document, then, seeks merely to seed the necessary intellectual processes, in the academic and diplomatic communities in Israel and abroad, and in the planning bodies serving the Government of Israel and the Jewish people.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Table of contents	6
Alternatives to the "Two-State" Notion	7
Zionist Movement's Original Plan.....	7
San Remo Plan (International Community).....	7
Ben-Gurion's Plan: Expansion	7
Allon Plan	8
"Greater Land of Israel" Plan.....	8
The Likud Constitution	8
Golda Meir's Policy	9
Moshe Dayan's Plan	9
Autonomy Plan – Menachem Begin.....	9
3-Stage Plan: Labor Party IN its Heyday, 1992.....	10
Jordan is Palestine plan.....	10
"Less than a State" – Yitzchak Rabin.....	10
Oslo Accords	11
A Place Under the Sun – Benjamin Netanyahu.....	11
Transfer Plan – Rechavam Ze'evi	11
A Jewish-Democratic State – Reuven Rivlin	12
The Political Process – Moshe Feiglin	12
Israeli Initiative – Benny Elon.....	13
Relief plan – Naftali Bennett	13
Economic Peace Plan – General (Res.) Uzi Dayan	13
Yisrael Beiteinu Plan –Avigdor Liberman	13
"Israeli Solution" – Caroline Glick.....	14
Jordan Model – Guy Bechor	15
Puerto Rico Model – Guy Bechor.....	15
3-State Plan (Israel/Egypt/Jordan) – John Bolton.....	15
Yesha Council Plan — Herzliya Conference.....	15
8 Emirates Plan – Mordechai Kedar.....	16
Humanitarian Approach – Dr. Martin Sherman	16
Jordanian-Palestinian option – Giora Eiland	17
"Out-of-the-Box Peace Plan (Savyon,, 2013).....	17
Sovereignty Mosaic – Dr. Yuval Arnon-Ohanna.....	19
Sinai Plan – Stephen Gabriel Rosenberg.....	19
Jewish Democratic State – Uri Elitzur	19
"Settlement is Peace" – Moshe Levinger	20
Land for money – Hagai Segal.....	20
Continuing the Status Quo – Chaim Navon.....	20
Summary: commonalities	21
Sources and biographical sketches	22

ALTERNATIVES TO THE "TWO-STATE" NOTION

ZIONIST MOVEMENT'S ORIGINAL PLAN

The Land of Israel (both sides of the Jordan River) belongs to the Jewish people. “The historic demand of the Israeli nation (is)...to return to the Jewish people the land that was promised to them by the Almighty 4,000 years ago” (Ussishkin, 1919). When Herzl established a financial instrument for the Zionist Movement (today’s Bank Leumi), branches were set up in Jaffa, Jerusalem, Haifa, Safed and Tiberius – but also in Beirut, Hebron and Gaza. Throughout the second half of the 19th century, and the early 20th century, Zionists made private and institutional attempts to purchase land for settlement on the eastern bank of the Jordan, considered an inseparable part of the Land of Israel.

SAN REMO PLAN (INTERNATIONAL COMMUNITY)

The Land of Israel allocated for a Jewish national home, by an irrevocable promise given to the Jewish people by the international community. The remainder of the Middle East was allocated for self-determination of the Arab nation, previously subjugated to the Turkish empire. Jewish majority to be generated in one tiny location in the world, by immigration and “dense settlement” of Jews over at least the smaller, western portion of the Land of Israel (including Judea, Samaria and Gaza i.e.). Plan approved unanimously in 1922 by the League of Nations, fore-runner of the United Nations. Plan survived the League of Nations by virtue of Paragraph 80 which was included in Chapter 12 of the UN Charter at the behest of Prof. Ben-Zion Netanyahu and other public figures.

BEN-GURION'S PLAN: EXPANSION

Supported creation of a Jewish state, however tiny, to facilitate establishment of an army. Accepted 1947 Partition Plan knowing the Arabs would reject it, whereupon Israel could legitimately establish reasonable borders during the war the Arabs would declare. In 1956, suggested borders to France: North – Litani River; East – Jordan River; south – Suez Canal. Believed expansion should take place with as low a price as possible in terms of number of Arab residents. Supported expulsion of hostile populations in conditions of existential war. Did not believe that a separate “Palestinian nation” existed.

After the Six Day War, advocated Israel returning to the Green Line except in Jerusalem and the Golan -- if the Arab countries would agree to a comprehensive peace. In 1972 changed his mind, both because he had given up on the chance of peace with the Arab states and because he was impressed with the success of the re-settlement movement. Supported Jewish resettlement of Hebron to which he provided his personal financial support.

ALLON PLAN

Incorporating into Israel a strip of land 10 – 15 km wide west of the Jordan River; an area adjacent the Dead Sea and an area around Greater Jerusalem including Latrun, and building permanent settlements in these areas. In the Judean Desert, including Kiryat Arba, the strip's width would be 25 km. Following negotiations with Israel's neighbors, other parts of Judea and Samaria would become autonomous but economically linked to Israel. Palestinians would choose political relations with Jordan and/or Israel. Inspired by the Allon Plan, Labor-led governments established 21 settlements in Jordan Valley and Eastern Shomron. In the mid-1990s, an "Allon-Plus Plan" advocated adding settlement blocs to the original plan. The Allon Plan's designations of militarily necessary regions assumed infantry-based enemy military power rather than ballistic missiles which arc over borders, increasing the importance of topography and distance.

"GREATER LAND OF ISRAEL" PLAN

Plan proposed by prominent Israeli intellectuals (Natan Alterman, Rachel Yanait Ben-Zvi, Isser Harel, S.Y. Agnon, and others) immediately following the Six Day War. The group advocated that Israeli retain and populate Judea, Samaria and the Gaza Strip, the Sinai Peninsula and the Golan Heights.

THE LIKUD CONSTITUTION

The objective is to populate and apply sovereignty over the entire Land of Israel. The Likud's mentor, Ze'ev Jabotinsky, famously said that "The Land of Israel is characterized by the fact that the Jordan River runs down its center, not at its border." In practice, the Likud built many dozens of new settlements in Judea and Samaria (19 new settlements in 1984 alone, for example). The Likud advocated IDF presence in all of Judea and Samaria.

GOLDA MEIR'S POLICY

Golda Meir did not believe in the existence of a separate “Palestinian nation”. In her view, the State of Israel currently subsists within 1949 cease-fire lines which rent Jerusalem asunder and were a scant 20 minute drive from Tel Aviv. These were not borders; borders to be determined upon Israel’s signing of peace agreements with her neighbors. Goals: security, normalization, and encouragement of co-existence between Israelis and Arabs in the territories held by Israel, to model the relationship that could exist between Israelis and Arabs. Israel hopes to retain certain areas beyond the 1949 cease-fire lines, and Israel has not taken an explicit stand about other areas. If Arab sovereignty is applied to a particular area in the framework of a peace agreement, its Jewish communities will continue to exist. It is impossible to accept an arrangement which would prevent Jews from living in locations historically and religiously significant to the Jewish people.

MOSHE DAYAN'S PLAN

Dayan’s extensive contacts with the Arab public led him to conclude that no one solution could appeal to both a majority of Jews and a majority of Arabs. Therefore, he suggested that the Palestinians be entrusted with as much authority over internal affairs as possible, while security issues would remain in Israel’s hands. The question of sovereignty should remain unresolved. Dayan did not address the Jewish communities in Judea and Samaria, which hardly existed in his period.

AUTONOMY PLAN – MENACHEM BEGIN

Control the land but not the residents – a solution designed to reconcile the concept of “two sides of the Jordan” with the desire to provide rights to individuals of Arab origin living in the Land of Israel (“Palestinians”). Arabs in the Land of Israel will control all their own internal affairs but not foreign relations or security. No territory would be handed over to Jordan, because Jordan held the land illegally ever since it invaded Israel during the War of Independence. Israel would defer its demand for sovereignty until “permanent agreement” negotiations commenced. The Arab residents of Judea, Samaria and Jerusalem are Jordanian citizens. (In contrast to the residents of Gaza, to whom Egypt never gave citizenship.)

3-STAGE PLAN: LABOR PARTY IN ITS HEYDAY, 1992

Land for peace, defensible borders, no uprooting of settlements. Autonomy in Judea, Samaria and Gaza.

Permanent agreement with territorial compromise on Israel's part, but "even in times of peace – maintain defensible borders which ...will enable Israel to protect itself by itself".

The peace treaties will declare that the conflict has ended, with no additional demands to surface in future. "Israel's security needs require...a Jordanian-Palestinian framework...and not a Palestinian state...the Jordan Valley... is the security border of the State.

The areas evacuated by Israel will be demilitarized. Israel will retain vital areas that are not densely populated. Settlements in areas that Israel withdraws from can remain and their security will be guaranteed.

A new Middle East without wars or terrorism.

JORDAN IS PALESTINE PLAN

A Palestinian state already exists – in Jordan: Demographically, most of the population in Jordan is Palestinian. Geographically, the Kingdom of Jordan consists of 78% of the Mandate for Palestine that was promised to the Jewish people.

"LESS THAN A STATE" – YITZCHAK RABIN

- A. The area of the State of Israel will include most of the territory of the Land of Israel, as it was during the era of the British Mandate.**
- B. Even under a permanent agreement, Israel will not go back to the pre- 1967 lines. The main changes: Incorporation into Israel of a united Jerusalem, Maale Adumim, Givat-Ze'ev, Gush Etzion, Efrat, Beitar and other settlements. Settlement blocs like Gush-Katif should also be established in Judea and Samaria.**
- C. Israel's security border will lie in the Jordan Valley.**
- D. A Palestinian entity in the Gaza Strip and in the area of the West Bank will run the daily lives of the Palestinians but will be less than a state.**

OSLO ACCORDS

The architects of the Oslo Accords explicitly rejected establishment of a Palestinian state. In Hebron, security procedures for Cave of Patriarchs to remain unchanged. In Rachel's Tomb, worshippers were not to encounter Palestinian policemen; main road to Rachel's Tomb to be IDF's responsibility. Movement and prayer arrangements in the "Shalom Al Yisrael" synagogue in Jericho were to remain the same. Joseph's Tomb in Shechem (Nablus) under Israeli security control.

In Area B (incorporating about 450 Arab villages and many Jewish sites), control over everyday life was in Palestinian hands whereas overriding security authority was to remain in Israeli hands. Area C (over 70% of the territory) was retained under full Israeli control.

A PLACE UNDER THE SUN – BENJAMIN NETANYAHU

A Palestinian state in Jordan but not in Judea and Samaria. This is not a call for regime change – the question of who will govern is an internal Jordanian-Palestinian question. Self-rule for the residents of Judea and Samaria (similar to the Basques' region). The focus of the autonomy has to be on urban centers. In the permanent agreement, residents of Judea and Samaria keep their Jordanian citizenship and sovereignty is applied in stages. Initially, sovereignty would be applied to the Jewish settlements of Judea and Samaria.

TRANSFER PLAN – RECHAVAM ZE'EV

The concept of Transfer was voiced by many Zionist and Israeli leaders including Herzl, Ben-Gurion, Weizmann, Sharett, Eshkol. Transfer was inherent in Zionism: transfer of Jews from the Diaspora to Zion; of Arabs to the Land of Israel to enjoy Jewish prosperity; and as a result of wars – of the Arabs back to the lands of their forefathers. Transfer is deemed unethical yet is proposed for the 120,000 Jews who lived (at that time) in Judea and Samaria.

Transfer would end the Intifada as opposed to concessions which proved to the Arab side that they had succeeded by using the tool of terrorism: Ending the Intifada without entertaining Arab demands for Haifa and Jaffa was achievable only by separating the two nations. We, in our only land of our forefathers, and the Arabs in their 21 countries. Israel absorbed approximately 2 million Jewish refugees. Why aren't the Arab countries absorbing their Palestinian brothers in order to stop the murder of our two nations?

Three types of transfer:

By agreement between governments: When an Arab government comes to negotiate peace, Israel should say that our first condition is that Arab government must accept from us 1.5 million Palestinians who share their language, culture and religion.

Voluntary: Transfer should be encouraged at the individual level, even without an Arab government agreeing to it. King Hussein persuaded approximately 60,000 Arabs per year to leave Judea and Samaria.

Under duress: Only if Israel is attacked on its vulnerable eastern front, since Israel could not tolerate a fifth column during such a difficult war.

A JEWISH-DEMOCRATIC STATE – REUVEN RIVLIN

No to separation: Like it or not, Jews and Arabs co-exist in the Land of Israel. Even today there are shared pockets on both sides of the Green Line and Jewish and Arab university students study together in Haifa, Beer Sheba, Jerusalem and Ariel. A political solution based on separation is completely impracticable. Oslo's concept – separation, the paradigm of two states – is not feasible between the Jordan and the sea. Prime ministers from the right and the left have tried to implement the idea of separation and have failed.

No to dividing the Land of Israel: Relinquishing our historic right to the entire Land of Israel is a greater danger than a bi-national state. Every concession of this historic right to live anywhere in the Land undermines the foundations of the Zionist enterprise. Attempts to divide the land have failed repeatedly.

The alternative: One state, with a solid Jewish majority, truly Jewish, and truly democratic, is the sole possibility. Only the Left speaks of a bi-national state. We coped with a far more challenging demographic ratio when the State of Israel was established and only 600,000 Jews lived here.

THE POLITICAL PROCESS – MOSHE FEIGLIN

Settle, develop and apply Israeli sovereignty to all parts of the Land of Israel. Permanent-resident status for Arabs who live in Judea, Samaria and Gaza. Israeli citizenship to those who wish to be a part of Israel. Arabs of Judea and Samaria who desire to vote for Parliament can do so in one of the 22 Arab states established after World War I. Gaza: Only permanent liberation of this part of the land of Israel justifies risking soldiers' lives. An emigration package would be offered to Gaza residents who wish to leave the region since surveys have shown most Gazans do wish to emigrate.

ISRAELI INITIATIVE – BENNY ELON

The international community should formulate a multi-year plan to naturalize Palestinian émigré's ("refugees") in various countries, including providing them with an acclimatization grant. Dismantlement of UNRWA and "refugee" camps. The Palestinian Authority and armed organizations should no longer be recognized and their weaponry confiscated. The international community should recognize the Kingdom of Jordan as the representative of the Palestinians. Promotion of comprehensive peace between Israel and the Arab countries. Israeli sovereignty in Judea and Samaria. The Arab residents of Judea and Samaria would be Jordanian citizens. Their status, and the method of governance in the areas in which they live, would be determined by agreement between Jordan and Israel.

RELIEF PLAN – NAFTALI BENNETT

Unilateral application of Israeli sovereignty over Area C – full citizenship for the 50,000 Arabs who live in this area.

Autonomy under the auspices of the Palestinian Authority in Areas A, B of Judea and Samaria, although the IDF would retain ultimate control over the entire territory ("If the IDF leaves, Hamas will enter.")

No link to be made between Gaza and Judea and Samaria – instead, link Gaza to Egypt.

Not a single Palestinian refugee from Arab countries to be allowed into Judea and Samaria, in contrast to what would occur if a Palestinian state were to be established in this area.

Financial investment to encourage co-existence. For example, currently, thousands of Israelis and Arabs suffer together from entirely avoidable traffic congestion.

ECONOMIC PEACE PLAN – GENERAL (RES.) UZI DAYAN

Economic peace, and not the political process that sprouted from Oslo, will improve both the Jews' and Arabs' financial well-being and bring about a real peace. The Jewish settlers in Judea-Samaria are those who are making de-facto peace and giving a livelihood to thousands of Palestinian families, thereby contributing to society and the region.

YISRAEL BEITEINU PLAN –AVIGDOR LIBERMAN

Population and land exchange, a principle espoused even by Henry Kissinger, should replace "land for peace" policy. Realistically, transfer of Arabs is impossible – transfer can be perpetrated only against Jews. The Jewish state should be as homogenous as possible. The only connection of much of the Arab population to Israel is social security, unemployment benefits, and medical care. Rather than

subsidizing this population, the Wadi Ara region and eastern portions of Jerusalem may be transferred to the Palestinian Authority. To clinch the population and land transfer, Israel needs a Citizenship Law that would require all who desire Israeli citizenship, Jews and Arabs, to affirm loyalty to the State of Israel as a Jewish and Zionist state. While the international community and American government will always exploit fissures in Israeli society, anything Israelis agree upon among themselves will eventually gain acceptance abroad.

"ISRAELI SOLUTION" – CAROLINE GLICK

- A. **The Palestinian Central Bureau of Statistics has exaggerated Palestinian population figures by nearly 50 percent (1.34 million people).**
- B. **Israel should annex Judea and Samaria just as it annexed Jerusalem. Jews will still be a demographic majority of well over 60% between the Jordan River and the Mediterranean.**
- C. **As Palestinians continue to emigrate and Jewish immigration picks up, Jews will become an 80 percent majority by 2035.**
- D. **Israel can offer West Bank Arabs the opportunity to apply for Israeli citizenship (voting rights); all others would have full civil rights but not voting rights.**
- E. **Israel will irk the international community when it annexes Judea and Samaria, but has no choice since she requires most of Judea and Samaria in order to defend itself.**

FIVE-STAGE SOVEREIGNTY PLAN –TZIPI HOTOVELY

Stage 1: National Plan for Aliya – 2 million immigrants within a decade. Nine million Jews live in the Diaspora but aliya statistics show only a few thousand a year. When the state was established there were 660,000 Jews and 440,000 Arabs, but the aliya challenge gave Ben-Gurion the courage to follow the Zionist vision.

Stage 2: Legislation – Full Israeli citizenship, contingent on accepting equal responsibilities.

Stage 3: Application of sovereignty to areas of Jewish settlement in Judea and Samaria. Only 100,000 Palestinians will receive Israeli citizenship.

Stage 4: Anchoring the symbols of the state and the Law of Return in Basic Laws to be passed by a majority of 80 Members of Knesset, and not to be subject to change other than by a similar majority.

Stage 5: Determining principles for the educational system in Israel in order to prevent incitement to terrorism. This will enable Israel to absorb 1.5 million Arabs upon culmination of the sovereignty process.

JORDAN MODEL – GUY BECHOR

All Arab residents of Judea and Samaria have a right to Jordanian citizenship and should demand this in international tribunals -- or Israel should do so for them. Although King Hussein of Jordan nullified these residents' Jordanian citizenship in 1988, international law forbids the annulment of citizenship to anyone who would thereby remain stateless, so Hussein's move was illegal.

Full Israeli sovereignty to be applied to Area C. In the remaining portions of Judea-Samaria, Jordan will have civil control and Israel will have security control, in a manner that will be mutually determined.

PUERTO RICO MODEL – GUY BECHOR

Puerto Rico, an island with some 4 million residents, is an American protectorate whose residents enjoy administrative autonomy but have no right to vote or be elected to office in the United States. If this solution exists in American democracy, why not here? Nobody claims that there is an "apartheid" regime regarding Puerto Rico.

3-STATE PLAN (ISRAEL/EGYPT/JORDAN) – JOHN BOLTON

Instead of pursuing the misguided notion of "two states," provide Palestinians with personal dignity and security, economic growth and responsible, responsive government. Attach disparate Palestinian communities in West Bank and Gaza to neighboring contiguous states Jordan and Egypt. The contentious issue of Jerusalem as capital of "Palestine" would disappear: Amman would obviously be the seat of government for enlarged Jordan. International assistance to Egypt and Jordan for their efforts. "One place to avoid problems is dispensing with intricate discussions over the exact legal status of" Gaza and Judea-Samaria (e.g. "state" status).

YESHA COUNCIL PLAN — HERZLIYA CONFERENCE

Dismantle Palestinian security organizations and confiscate arms; supporting 60,000 "policemen" is a significant burden on the Palestinian economy. Terminating incitement against Jews, Israel in mosques, schools and media. Transportation contiguity, with no roadblocks or points of friction. Residents of the Palestinian contiguity will be citizens of the Palestinian Authority which will have

a confederative link with Jordan. At this stage, State of Israel will apply its sovereignty to approximately 60% of the area of Judea and Samaria. Israel will annex about 300,000 Palestinian Arabs, residents of small villages scattered in under-populated areas of Judea and Samaria. Eventually, these residents will become Israeli citizens, increasing the percentage of Arabs in Israel from 20% to 23.5%. In every international forum, Israel will demand that Egypt allow the Gaza Strip to expand eastward, to an area that is small and marginal from Egypt's point of view.

8 EMIRATES PLAN – MORDECHAI KEDAR

Tribalism principle: From a socio-cultural standpoint, Palestinian Arabs in the western Land of Israel are split into separate tribes or clans which even tend to avoid “mixed marriages” between them. Therefore, the solution is hegemony of each tribe in its own territory: non-contiguous city-states in 7 cities of Judea-Samaria: Jenin, Nablus, Ramallah, Jericho, Tulkarem, Kalkilya, and Arab Hebron. An 8th “emirate” would be the Gaza strip. Separate bilateral relations between the State of Israel and each tribe. Most Arabs would become citizens of these emirates. Those in rural areas may choose to become citizens of Israel. The Palestinian emigre problem can be solved only in Arab states.

HUMANITARIAN APPROACH – DR. MARTIN SHERMAN

Any realistic policy approach cannot be oblivious to the Palestinian failure to establish a stable, productive civil society despite the most conducive conditions ever enjoyed by any post-World War I national independence moment. But the genuine humanitarian plight of Palestinians must be addressed by (a) dismantling UNRWA; (b) eliminating ethnic discrimination against Palestinians resident in Arab countries; and (c) practical measures geared to Palestinian individuals directly, without any agreement with any Arab state or organization.

Re (a), the world's refugees are all under UNHCR auspices, except for Palestinians for whom alone UNRWA exists. If the UNHCR criteria for refugees replaces UNRWA's lenient, unique criterion, the number of Palestinian “refugees” would shrink to 200,000. UNHCR's staff of 5,000, dealing with 30 million refugees, typically finds permanent solutions in less than 2 generations. UNRWA's staff of 25,000 has found no solutions for “4.5 million (200,000) Palestinian refugees” in 6 decades.

Re (b), Arab countries deny citizenship to and ethnically discriminate against Palestinians who have been resident for decades, severely restricting freedom of movement, employment, and property ownership. Surveys have demonstrated a

Palestinian desire for citizenship and even Mahmoud Abbas once requested this. But the Arab League prefer to use Palestinians as political pawns, since if Palestinians are accommodated in Arab countries, they will have no reason to "return to Palestine". An assertive diplomatic drive must mobilize international pressure on Arab governments to end this ethnic discrimination.

Re (c), the two-state solution fails geographically whereas the one-state solution fails demographically. Individual Palestinians under Israeli administration in Judea and Samaria must be allowed to exercise free will by providing generous monetary compensation for relocation abroad, preferably but not necessarily in Arab/Muslim countries. Offers for compensated relocation to be made directly to families, not via any organization with a vested contrary interest. For prospective host nations, economic upside: capital inflow of around 1 billion dollars for each 5000 families absorbed – since Palestinian immigrants will not be penniless refugees but rather wealthy relative to average world GNP per capita. Nonetheless, the economic cost is probably less costly than the two-state solution. If grants per family unit amounting to almost two centuries (!) of current GDP per capita in Judea-Samaria were spread over 15 to 20 years, Israel – whose GDP is a quarter-trillion dollars – could bear most of the cost itself: if the yearly outlay (around 3% of Israeli GDP) were added to the defense budget, the defense budget's share of GDP would not exceed levels in the late 1980s and early 1990s.

JORDANIAN-PALESTINIAN OPTION – GIORA EILAND

A federated kingdom with 3 states, in the American sense: Jordan of today, Judea and Samaria, and Gaza. Each of the three to be independent in internal matters but – similar to Pennsylvania and New Jersey – they will not have any responsibility for foreign policy nor have an army. Foreign and military issues, as in the United States, will remain in the hands of the "federal government" in Amman.

"OUT-THE-BOX PEACE PLAN (SAVYON, 2013)

Based on three principles: The right to ethnic separation, equalizing population densities, and the "big picture" principle.

Average population density in the world is 50 people/sq. km. In the Mideast, the most densely populated country (Lebanon) has 400 people/sq. km. A Palestinian state to house ten million Palestinians worldwide corresponds to a horrific population density of 2,000 people/sq. km -- hence is completely unjustified. A "big picture" principle would redraw the current artificial bloody borders, taking a broad

view of all countries surrounding the disputed territory and maintaining the interests of the leading international powers as well.

Harnessing financial partnership of the Great Powers, a map of the future for a just Middle East, Marshall Plan-style, might be:

- A. Rejection of the Saudi demand that Israel hand over 20% of its territory to the Palestinians, since Israel is already at the level of the highest population density in the Middle East – nearly 400 people/sq. km currently, or 630 people/sq. km if all the Jews of the world immigrate. In contrast, Saudi Arabia itself has the largest land area – almost 100 times that of Israel. If Saudi Arabia contributes 410,000 sq. km. – less than 20% of its huge territory – to the peace plan the Saudis so much want to promote, Saudi Arabia would still be the least dense country in the Middle East (16 people/sq. km). Saudi Arabia would be compensated with \$100–200 billion over 20–50 years, to be used towards the development of petrol alternatives, tourism, water desalination, desert agriculture and transportation.
- B. Of the 410,000 sq. km. made available by Saudi Arabia, 25,000 sq. km. would be transferred to Israel, 125,000 to the Palestinians, and 260,000 to the Hashemite Kingdom. The Palestinians would get an additional 5,000 sq. km. from Jordan, meaning that altogether the Palestinian Arabs would possess an area 25 times larger than Judea and Samaria.
- C. Most of the area of western Israel would stay in Israeli hands, except for Palestinian cantons, as well as: 85,000 sq. km from today's Jordan to fulfill the promises made in San Remo; 25,000 sq. km. from northwestern Saudi Arabia; and 25,000 sq. km. from eastern Sinai (Egypt – from El Arish to Ras Mohammed).
- D. Financial compensation to Egypt and a much larger area from Northern Sudan and/or Libya, in exchange for fair financial and other compensation to Sudan and/or Libya.
- E. The new Hashemite Kingdom would get territory in northern Saudi Arabia, enlarging its area threefold, including access to the Red Sea and/or the Arabian Gulf + financial compensation + closer proximity to Islam's holiest cities (Mecca and Medina).
- F. Doubling Lebanon's size to alleviate its density. Establishment of an independent Druze state that is approximately 5,000 sq. km. in size, in the region of the Syrian Druze mountain and extending towards the Chouf Mountains via southern Lebanon and up to the Mediterranean Sea.
- G. 3 new countries (Shiite, Sunni, free Kurdistan) to replace today's Iraq.

SOVEREIGNTY MOSAIC – DR. YUVAL ARNON-OHANNA

Sovereignty would be applied throughout the territory according to who owns the land, mosaic-style. The Palestinians would govern all of their cities, villages and subsidiary settlements, as well as the farmland they work. Israel would govern all of its cities, settlements and state lands. To enable freedom of movement, all roads and the sky will be declared communal property open to all. The territory will be completely demilitarized on the Palestinian side, and a number of additional “defensive lines” will be established for Israel’s security.

SINAI PLAN – STEPHEN GABRIEL ROSENBERG

The Gaza Strip is tiny. Its teeming population has little means of livelihood. Egypt lacks the finances and expertise to make the most of its country e.g. widening the Suez Canal and building a new Suez City. Sinai remains virtually uninhabited and useless. Since Sinai abuts Egypt, Gaza and Israel, a 20 km wide north-to-south slice of Sinai could be given to the Gazans. Egypt can donate the land, the United States and Saudi Arabia the finances, Israel and the Europeans will provide energy and expertise. Gaza can supply the labor.

JEWISH DEMOCRATIC STATE – URI ELITZUR

Jewish history obliges us not to abandon the heart of the country. Hence the proposal is a democratic state for the Jewish people with one-third Arab citizens. Full Israeli citizenship, in stages, for the 1.5 million Arabs in Judea and Samaria. Whoever insists this is impossible is relegating us to bomb shelters, filling Judea and Samaria with another 3-5 million Arabs, and closing the door to future Jewish generations in-gathering to the land of their forefathers -- all so as not to contaminate “white Tel Aviv” with Arabs. The demographic challenge of declaring independence in 1948 was far greater, hence the Jewish people may be assumed to have the energy and strength for this proposal. Legislating Israel’s status as the Nation-State of the Jewish People is a necessary first step.

"SETTLEMENT IS PEACE" – MOSHE LEVINGER

Full, effective Israeli sovereignty over the entire Land of Israel, together with respect for each person who was created in the image of God. These values complement each other: We will purchase and populate the Land of Israel, but we will neither oppress nor abuse. Noam Arnon, spokesperson for the Jewish community of Hebron: “In Hebron, Rabbi Levinger greatly respected his neighbors who desired peace, and they respected him. After Rabbi Levinger’s death, consolation letters arrived from the heads of the largest and most important tribes in the city.”

LAND FOR MONEY – HAGAI SEGAL

A territorial agreement was reached in 2016 between Saudi Arabia and Egypt, “returning” the islands of Tiran and Sanafir to the Saudis in exchange for money. It seems land is not that holy to the Arab nation! It has also been reported that Egypt has expressed willingness to establish a homeland for Palestinian “refugees” in Sinai. It is therefore clear that it is feasible for Israel to make some sort of arrangement with Egypt and the Palestinians in exchange for a good sum of money: land for shekels.

CONTINUING STATUS QUO – CHAIM NAVON

The argument that Israel must either give the Palestinians citizenship or leave the territories – that it is impossible to have both – is a strong one, but both of these alternatives are a disaster in the making. The world doesn’t appreciate this, both because the world doesn’t care if something terrible happens to us and because other countries in the developed world don’t contain hostile nationalist minorities: In the years following World War II, 20 million people were violently expelled from Europe, and since then Europe has been fairly homogeneous. Continuing the current situation is the least bad solution available in our region. The nations of the world don’t understand these arguments -- but it is preferable for Israelis to live with foreign rage than to die with foreign sympathy.

SUMMARY: COMMONALITIES

- **Applying Israeli sovereignty to Judea-Samaria (partial/ full/cantons - immediately/in stages)**
 - **Jewish resettlement is a solution not a problem**
 - **No “state” status to be granted to Arab sector in Judea-Samaria**
 - **Hand outstretched for peace**
 - **Safeguarding human rights**
 - **Refutation of narratives re “Palestinian nation” with “right of return”**
 - **Israel cannot grant immediate, full citizenship to all Arabs in Land of Israel**
 - **Refutation of inflated demographic claims: Can Israel not annex even a single Arab settlement??**
 - **Encourage Arab emigration from Judea and Samaria**
 - **A nation-state (e.g. Israel) need not necessarily have territorial contiguity**
-
-

SOURCES AND BIOGRAPHICAL SKETCHES

Presented in alphabetical order of authors or authoring entities. Biographical sketches of authors may include only the most senior position they have held.

(H) and (E) indicate the language of a source to be Hebrew or English, respectively.

Agnon, Shai

Nobel Literature Prize laureate

(H) Naor, Aryeh. *Whole Land of Israel (Eretz Yisrael HaShleima)*, Zmora-Bitan, 2001.

Allon, Yigal

Minister and deputy prime minister, Government of Israel

Commander of the Palmach

(H) Bet Alon archives

(H) <http://wordpress.darotools.com/bet-alon/2016/04/03/%D7%AA%D7%9B%D7%A0%D7%99%D7%AA-%D7%90%D7%9C%D7%95%D7%9F>

(H) <https://www.knesset.gov.il/process/asp/event.asp?ID=8>

(H) https://he.wikipedia.org/wiki/%D7%AA%D7%95%D7%9B%D7%A0%D7%99%D7%AA_%D7%90%D7%9C%D7%95%D7%9F

(E) "Israel: The Case for Defensible Borders", Yigal Allon, FOREIGN AFFAIRS, October 1976. <https://www.foreignaffairs.com/articles/israel/1976-10-01/israel-case-defensible-borders>

(E) http://www.palestinefacts.org/pf_1967to1991_allon_plan.php

Alterman, Natan

Poet, playwright and journalist, Socialist Zionist ideologue

(H) Naor, Aryeh. *Whole Land of Israel (Eretz Yisrael HaShleima)*, Zmora-Bitan, 2001.

Arens, Prof. Moshe

Defense Minister, Government of Israel

(H) "Interview with Prof. Moshe Arens," *HaMetzuda*, Newsletter for Likud members, issue dated 13/6/02

Arnon-Ohanna, Dr. Yuval

Former member of Israel's Intelligence community

(H) <http://www.acpr.org.il/pp/pp145-Ohanna-H.pdf>

(E) [http://www.acpr.org.il/nativ_e/078-nativ-toc.htm#An Alternative to the Oslo Agreement: Open "Mosaic" Sovereignty](http://www.acpr.org.il/nativ_e/078-nativ-toc.htm#An%20Alternative%20to%20the%20Oslo%20Agreement%3A%20Open%20%E2%80%9C%E2%80%9CMosaic%E2%80%9CSovereignty)

Bechor, Dr. Guy

Conservative commentator, journalist – Army Radio, Haaretz, et al

(H) http://www.gplanet.co.il/prodetailsamewin.asp?pro_id=3029

(website of Dr. Guy Bechor)

Begin, Menachem

Prime Minister of Israel, Nobel Peace Prize Laureate

(H) <https://www.knesset.gov.il/process/docs/autonomy1977.htm>

(E) <http://www.nytimes.com/1982/09/06/world/text-of-begin-s-letter-to-reagan-dealing-with-lebanon-and-the-west-bank.html>

Ben-Gurion, David

Prime Minister of Israel

(H) <http://www.nrg.co.il/online/1/ART2/009/120.html>

Bennet, Naftali

Chief of Staff, Prime Minister's office. Minister, Government of Israel

Graduate of elite Israel Defense Force unit

(H) <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Fcmnx6gJwMc>

(E) <http://www.wsj.com/articles/SB10001424052702304081804579559432394067704>

Ben-Zvi, Rachel Yanait

"First lady" – spouse of Yitzhak Ben-Zvi, second President of the State of Israel

Leading Labor Zionist

(H) Naor, Aryeh. *Whole Land of Israel (Eretz Yisrael HaShleima, Zmora-Bitan, 2001.*

Bolton, John

Former U.S. Ambassador to the United Nations

(E) <http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2009/01/04/AR2009010401434.html>

Dayan, Moshe

Chief of Staff, Israel Defense Forces

Defense Minister and Foreign Minister, Government of Israel.

(E) Shoal, Zalman, *"When there is No Peace,"* Jerusalem Post, 2/4/13.

<http://www.jpost.com/Opinion/Op-Ed-Contributors/When-there-is-no-peace-308353>

Dayan, Uzi

Israel Defense Forces Gen. (Res.)

(H) Kahane, Ariel. *"Interview with Uzi Dayan,"* Makor Rishon issue 831 (printed edition), 12/7/13

Eldad, Prof. Arieh

Brigadier General, Commander of Medical Corps, Israeli Defense Forces

Professor of Medicine, Hadassah Medical Center

Member of Knesset

(E), (H) <http://www.arieheldad.co.il/jordan-is-palestine>

Elitzur, Uri

Editor, Makor Rishon weekly

Bureau Chief, Prime Minister's Office

(H) <http://www.nrg.co.il/online/1/ART2/577/800.html> (article in *Yoman* section of *Makor Rishon*, issue 9.5.2014)

Elon, Rabbi Benny

Minister, Government of Israel

(H, E) www.hayozma.org

Eiland, Giora

Gen. (Res.), Israel Defense Forces

(H) <http://heb.inss.org.il/index.aspx?id=4665>

(E) <http://besacenter.org/wp-content/uploads/2010/01/alternatives.pdf>

Feiglin, Moshe

Member of Knesset, civil disobedience leader

(H) Feiglin, Moshe, *"The Political Process" (HaMahalach HaMedinā)*, distributed to Manhigut Yehudit section of the Likud, Iyyar 2003.

<http://feiglin.co.il/peace-and-security-2015>

Gal, Mark

Strategic Consultant, involved in developing alternatives to the two-state solution for over a decade

(H) "Marshall for the Middle East" – Out-of-the-Box Peace Plans Conference, Savyon, 2013

<http://www.likudnik.co.il/%D7%A9%D7%9C%D7%95%D7%9D-%D7%90%D7%9C%D7%98%D7%A8%D7%A0%D7%98%D7%99%D7%91%D7%99-%D7%9B%D7%A0%D7%A1-%D7%9E%D7%A1%D7%9B%D7%9D/>

Glick, Caroline

Assistant foreign policy advisor, Prime Minister's Office

Deputy managing editor and columnist, *Jerusalem Post*

BA (Political Science), Columbia University

MA (Public Policy), Harvard University's Kennedy School of Government

Captain, Israel Defense Forces

(E) Glick, Caroline. *Annexation Now*, Sela Meir Publications, 2015.

(E) <http://www.amazon.com/Israeli-Solution-One-State-Peace-Middle/dp/0385348061>

(E) http://www.atimes.com/atimes/Middle_East/MID-01-310314.html

Harel, Isser

Director of the Mossad

Responsible for capture of Holocaust arch-war criminal Adolf Eichmann

(H) Naor, Aryeh. *Whole Land of Israel (Eretz Yisrael HaShleima)*, Zmora-Bitan, 2001.

Hotovely, Tzipi

Deputy Foreign Minister, Government of Israel

(H) <http://www.nrg.co.il/online/1/ART2/487/799.html>

Kedar, Dr. Mordechai

Lecturer, Bar-Ilan University

25 years of service in Israel Defense Force's Military Intelligence

(E) www.palestinianemirates.com

Labor Party

Israel's ruling party until 1977 and occasionally thereafter

(H) <http://www.archavoda.org.il/avodaarch/matza/index.asp> (Israel Labor Party archives)

Levinger, Rabbi Moshe

Leader of modern Jewish resettlement in biblical Hebron

(H) <http://www.inn.co.il/News/News.aspx/30014611.6.15>

Lieberman, Avigdor

Minister of Defense, Government of Israel

(H) <http://www.herzliyaconference.org/?CategoryID=228&ArticleID=1687>

Likud

Superseded Labor as Israel's ruling party

In power almost continuously from 1977 to the present time

(H) <https://www.likud.org.il/images/huka/huka0716.pdf>

(H) *Yesha Diary, 1995-1996 (Yoman Yesha, 1995-1996)*, Yesha Council Publication

Meir, Golda

Prime Minister of Israel

(E) *Facts About Israel*, Israel Ministry of Foreign Affairs, 1973.

(H) *"Foreign Affairs and Security Policies, Economy and Society in Israel," (Medinyot Chutz U'Bitachon Kalkala VeChevra B'Yisrael)* Dov Ben-Meir. Appeared in *Knowledge of Nation and State (Yeda HaAm VeHaMedina)*, a high school textbook. *Makhon Yisraeli LeHaskala LeYad HaMerkaz LeTarbut U'LeChinuch*, 1972

(H) https://www.ariel.ac.il/images/stories/site/management/rd/social_publications/mamarim20/9.pdf

Navon, Rabbi Chaim

Conservative columnist

(H) Navon, Chaim. *"A Nation Alone"* (*Am Levadad*), Special Saturday night section of *Makor Rishon*, 19/6/15.

Netanyahu, Benjamin

Prime Minister of Israel

(H) <http://www.93fm.co.il/radio/107909>

(E) <http://www.amazon.com/Place-Among-Nations-Benjamin-Netanyahu/dp/0553089749>

Oslo Accords

Signed by Israel and the PLO in 1993, in the presence of, and witnessed by, the United States and European Union, Russia, Egypt, Jordan, and Norway

(H) https://www.knesset.gov.il/rabin/heb/Rab_RabinSpeech6.htm

(E) <http://www.imra.org.il/story.php3?id=49686>

(E) <http://www.mfa.gov.il/mfa/mfa-archive/1995/pages/pm%20rabin%20in%20knesset-%20ratification%20of%20interim%20agree.aspx>

(E) <http://peacemaker.un.org/israelopt-osloaccord93>

Rabin, Yitzhak

Prime Minister of Israel, Nobel Peace Prize Laureate

(H) https://www.knesset.gov.il/rabin/heb/Rab_RabinSpeech6.htm

(E) <http://www.imra.org.il/story.php3?id=49686>

(E) <http://www.mfa.gov.il/mfa/mfa-archive/1995/pages/pm%20rabin%20in%20knesset-%20ratification%20of%20interim%20agree.aspx>

Rivlin, Reuven

President of the State of Israel, Speaker of the Knesset

(H) <https://www.facebook.com/ReuvenRivlin/posts/486930931341603>

Rosenberg, Dr. Stephen Gabriel

Senior Fellow, Albright Institute of Archaeological Research

(E) <http://www.jpost.com/Opinion/The-Sinai-plan-372549>

San Remo Conference

International meeting of Principal Allied Powers of World War I in San Remo, Italy, in 1920 as an outgrowth of the Paris Peace Conference. "Mandates" were established for

three territories formerly part of the Ottoman empire: Syria, Mesopotamia and Palestine. One of the Allied Powers was to implement each mandate, until respective states emerged. The French mandate over Syria yielded 2 Arab states: Syria and Lebanon. Mesopotamia yielded the state of Iraq. Mandatory Palestine yielded today's Jordan and Israel. Other territories of the Ottoman Empire yielded, without an intervening Mandatory period, today's Saudi Arabia, Yemen, Kuwait, Bahrain, and Qatar. Thus, self-determination for both the Arab and Jewish nations was facilitated by the victors of World War I, including 9 additional states, previously non-existent, for the Arab nation as well as a single new state for the Jewish nation.

(E) <http://www.mfa.gov.il/mfa/foreignpolicy/peace/guide/pages/the%20mandate%20for%20palestine.aspx>

(E) <http://www.nysun.com/foreign/how-benzion-netanyahu-helped-put-in-the-un/87809>

Schlesinger, Shmuel

Honorary Consul for Croatia in Israel

(H) "Marshall for the Middle East" – Out-of-the-Box Peace Plans Conference, Savyon, 2013

<http://www.likudnik.co.il/%D7%A9%D7%9C%D7%95%D7%9D-%D7%90%D7%9C%D7%98%D7%A8%D7%A0%D7%98%D7%99%D7%91%D7%99-%D7%9B%D7%A0%D7%A1-%D7%9E%D7%A1%D7%9B%D7%9D/>

Segal, Hagai

Editor, Makor Rishon weekly, conservative commentator

(H) <http://www.nrg.co.il/online/1/ART2/769/497.html>

Shamir, Yitzhak

Prime Minister of Israel

(H) Misgav, Haim. Conversations with Yitzchak Shamir (*Sichot Im Yitzchak Shamir*), Sifriyat Poalim, 1997.

Sharon, Ariel

Prime Minister of Israel

(E) <http://www.wrmea.org/1989-september/ariel-sharon-israeli-claims-include-jordan.html>

Sherman, Dr. Martin

Ministerial adviser to Government of Israel – international relations

Lecturer, Tel Aviv University, Academic director, Herzliya Conference

(H) <http://www.news1.co.il/Archive/003-D-32669-00.html>

(E) <http://www.jpost.com/Opinion/Columnists/The-humanitarian-approach-Responding-to-readers-Part-I>

Yesha Council

Israeli non-governmental organization formed by the local government leaders of the Jewish community in Judea-Samaria.

Presenters at Herzliya Conference

(H) <http://www.nrg.co.il/online/1/ART1/037/852.html>

Ze'evi, Rechavam ("Ghandi")

Minister, Government of Israel

Israel Defense Forces Gen. (Res)

Assassinated by Palestinian terrorists

<https://www.ubank.co.il/essay/63562/%EE%F7%E5%F8%E5%FA-%F8%F2%E9%E5%EF-%E4%E8%F8%F0%F1%F4%F8-%E1%FA%F0%E5%F2%E4-%E4%F6%E9%E5%F0%E9%FA.html>

(H) <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=1GasGyme-H4>

(E) https://books.google.co.il/books?id=1XSRXaRKxROC&pg=PA108&lpg=PA108&dq=TRANSFER+REHAVAM+ZEEVI&source=bl&ots=zV93fPTSGX&sig=SyhPqTtmW1vK53q2TYVUPYzIH5M&hl=en&sa=X&ved=0ahUKEwj13JO06I7QAhWBPxQKHQ_4C044ChDoAQhFMAc#v=onepage&q=TRANSFER%20REHAVAM%20ZEEVI&f=false

Zionist Movement

(H) <http://www.leumi.co.il/Articles/11326> (Bank Leumi's website)

(H) http://www.ybz.org.il/_Uploads/dbsAttachedFiles/Article_24.8.pdf

